

Key components in the three models of teacher unionism

INDUSTRIAL

PROFESSIONAL

SOCIAL JUSTICE

Orientation

Emphasizes separation of labor and management. The role of the union is to limit what teachers can be asked to do and to increase the pay/benefits they get for doing it.

Emphasizes and defends teacher professionalism and promotes teacher leadership at school and district levels through union/district mentoring programs, etc.

Emphasizes alliances with parents and community to organize for social justice in schools, the community, and the curriculum. Challenges white supremacy and other forms of oppression.

View of Management

Assumes labor/management relations are hostile and adversarial.

Encourages management/labor cooperation to promote quality programs and achievement.

Partners with management when they promote anti-racist social justice policies, and organizes with parents and communities against management when they don't.

Bargaining

Win/lose bargaining with emphasis on bread-and-butter issues of salary, hours, and working conditions. Views the contract as way to institutionalize changes.

Interest-based bargaining that addresses teaching quality and programmatic initiatives, include MOUs outside of the contract. Views the contract as way to institutionalize changes.

Bargaining for the common good. Bargains bread-and-butter and professional issues, but balances those demands with the broader social justice issues in the schools and community. Views the contract as way to institutionalize changes, but rank-and-file and community organizing as key features in sustaining wins.

INDUSTRIAL

PROFESSIONAL

SOCIAL JUSTICE

District Decision-Making

Management prerogatives respected at school and district levels. Union staff grieves management decisions.

Seeks to expand decision-making and instructional leadership at school and district levels. Joint labor/management committees address professional issues.

Democratic input by key stakeholders through democratically elected school boards, shared leadership at school level, and district councils and committees that include educators, administrators, parents, community, and students. Promotes creation of transformative community schools.

Internal Union Leadership

Often a “business model” that is staff- and/or leader-dominated with limited member decision-making. Promotes member passivity except for occasional mobilizations. Members view “the union” as a third party—the staff and elected leaders.

Promotes moving significant leadership to the school level and works to infuse the district operations with teacher leaders.

Broad membership engagement and involvement in decision-making. Vision and direction provided by elected leadership; diversity and debate encouraged. Members view the union as “first person plural”—We are the union.

Service to Members

Staff “solves” most individual problems through contract enforcement.

Emphasis on school-based problem-solving.

School-based leaders are trained to organize staff to solve most problems at the school level. Districtwide problems are solved through pressure and collective action.

Equity and Race

At worst, defends white privilege; most commonly ignores such matters.

Main proponents of professional unionism are silent on race issues.

Strong emphasis on race and equity-supporting movements in the community on issues that don’t directly affect teachers. Openly deals with racial issues internal to the union.

INDUSTRIAL

PROFESSIONAL

SOCIAL JUSTICE

Pedagogy and Curriculum

Union cedes control of curriculum and professional development to management.

Union promotes additional responsibility for teacher leaders and brings teacher voice to design, implementation, and evaluation of curriculum, assessment, and instruction.

Union promotes more teaching and less testing, restorative practices over punitive discipline, and culturally relevant, anti-racist social justice curriculum that is participatory and connected to students' lives.

Student Rights/School Safety

Focus is on teacher authority, classroom control. Teachers quick to refer students for discipline, without listening to students. Leads to zero-tolerance policies and enables school-to-prison pipeline.

Silent on the subject.

Promotes restorative practices and anti-bias training of staff, and fights for the "schools the students deserve," which includes full social and health services, counseling, and respect for students' personal rights.

Social Issues, Community, and Parents

Limited involvement with social and community issues; parent outreach is emphasized only during bargaining or other contractual dispute with management.

Mainly silent on broader community issues. Works with parents to improve individual parent support for their child's learning.

Reaches out to community and parents to improve the quality of teaching and learning; supports social justice movements in the community even if not directly involved with schools and encourages members to participate in such movements.

Relations with the Labor Movement

Supports labor struggle when in the self-interest of teachers. (Historically NEA rank and file not encouraged to view themselves as part of the labor movement.)

Silent on the subject.

Views teacher unions as on the front lines to revitalize the labor movement. Stands in solidarity with labor struggles—both union-based and community-based, like \$15 and a Union.

SOURCES

- Kerchner, Charles Taylor and Julia E. Koppich. 1993. *A Union of Professionals: Labor Relations and Educational Reform*. Teachers College Press.
- Rethinking Our Unions Institute of the National Coalition of Education Activists, Portland 1994.
- Charney, Michael and Bob Peterson (eds.). 1999. *Transforming Teacher Unions: Fighting for Better Schools and Social Justice* (first edition). Rethinking Schools.
- The Three Frames of Progressive Unionism, from the NEA’s Center for Organizing.